ELA/Literacy Grade-Level Instructional Materials Evaluation Tool

Quality Review
GRADE 3

WCSD 2018

Washoe County School District
Every Child, By Name And Face, To Graduation℠

Council of the Great City Schools

COMPONENT 1: TEXT COMPLEXITY

The guiding statements provided in this section will examine text complexity in order to differentiate quality and richness among the texts WCSD is considering for adoption. To address the grade three standards, the submitted materials need to create the conditions for rich and robust discussion and writing for ALL students (struggling readers, students with identified academic disabilities, English Learners, students who are performing at grade level, and advanced students).

GUIDING STATEMENTS	SPECIFIC EVIDENCE FROM THE TEXT/MATERIALS	EVIDENCE RATING
Literature and Informational Text C1a. The texts present rich and embedded relationships between and among characters, ideas, and concepts that are conveyed through masterful style and structure. (See exemplars in CCSS, Appendix B.)		○ 4) extensive ● 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ○ 1) weak
C1b. The materials consistently include short, challenging, and complete texts that contain rich content, ideas, and academic language worthy of close reading. (See exemplars in CCSS, Appendix B.)		○ 4) extensive ○ 3) sufficient ● 2) some ○ 1) weak

C1c. The materials consistently provide opportunities to read both literary and informational texts in the grades three through five text complexity band with scaffolding as needed at the high end of the range.		○ 4) extensive ● 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ○ 1) weak
C1d. Materials provide instructional content and strategies for grade-level vocabulary acquisition.		○ 4) extensive ○ 3) sufficient ● 2) some ○ 1) weak

OVERALL RATING: ○ 4) extensive evidence ○ 3) sufficient evidence ● 2) some evidence ○ 1) weak evidence

SUMMARY STATEMENT (Explain why the materials received this overall rating):
Program has a wide range of books at many levels. Quality of close reads and vocabulary support is limited.

COMPONENT 2: QUESTIONS AND TASKS

At least 80% of all questions in the submission are high-quality text-dependent and text-specific questions. The overwhelming majority of these questions reference specific text and draw student attention to the text they are reading. Text-dependent questions that address the grade three standards will be described in greater depth in Alignment Criterion II.

ALIGNMENT CRITERION I: RANGE AND QUALITY OF TEXTS

Materials must reflect a wide range of text types and genres, as required by the standards. In grade three, and across all other grade levels, there should be ample texts on topics that can support sustained study. Knowledge built at one grade level should be expanded in other grade levels. Topics should take into account individual student academic needs and interests in order to foster independent reading. It is also imperative that the included topics and themes are compelling enough to read multiple times and are aligned to district needs. Pay particular attention to the guidance provided in Appendix B of the Common Core State Standards.

GUIDING STATEMENTS	SPECIFIC EVIDENCE FROM THE TEXT/MATERIALS	EVIDENCE RATING
Literature and Informational Text 1a. The range of materials, both print and digital, allows teachers and students to explore content that coherently and systematically builds knowledge and vocabulary across subjects, themes, and topics. (See CCSS Appendix B for examples of grade-level knowledge demands.) Text sets also address a wide variety of student interests, and are likely to foster independent reading.	All digital - have to print your own copies	○ 4) extensive ○ 3) sufficient ● 2) some ○ 1) weak
1b. Text sets include a diverse range of high quality, culturally-responsive and appropriate topics and themes. Texts from diverse cultures reflect the same high-quality features that are demanded of all texts.		○ 4) extensive ○ 3) sufficient ● 2) some ○ 1) weak

GUIDING STATEMENTS	SPECIFIC EVIDENCE FROM THE TEXT/MATERIALS	EVIDENCE RATING
1c. Materials include a rich and diverse sampling of literary texts including, but not limited to: • Fables, folktales, and myths from diverse cultures • Stories, drama, and poetry • Multiple stories by the same author		○ 4) extensive ○ 3) sufficient ● 2) some ○ 1) weak
1d.The range of informational texts include selections that: • Present historical events • Describe technical procedures • Present scientific ideas or concepts • Contain relevant visual representations of information • Contain at least two texts on the same topic	Like the non-fiction books better than the fiction ones - fiction author choices could be stronger	○ 4) extensive ● 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ○ 1) weak
1e. Student reading materials contain a range of increasingly challenging selections that allow teachers to build students' ability to comprehend complex text and expand vocabulary throughout the school year.	Multiple levels of books on particular topics	○ 4) extensive ● 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ○ 1) weak

OVERALL RATING: ○ 4) extensive evidence ○ 3) sufficient evidence ● 2) some evidence ○ 1) weak evidence

SUMMARY STATEMENT (Explain why the materials received this overall rating):
Non-fiction texts stronger than fiction selections.

ALIGNMENT CRITERION II. QUESTIONS AND TASKS SUPPORT STUDENT LEARNING

Questions posed to students in the materials under review should support student learning in building reading comprehension, in finding and producing the textual evidence to support responses, and in developing grade-level academic language and domain-specific words and phrases. Text for grade three students must include text-dependent questions that require the use of higher order thinking skills. There should be a range of questions that require students to attend to the author's language as his/her vehicle for conveying meaning, as well as to support specific inferences with explicit details from the text. Most questions should require that the student refer to the text in several places in order to devise an answer—rather than asking only literal, "right there" types of questions—and should also require the student to begin comparing texts, authors, and opinions (CCSS).

GUIDING STATEMENTS	SPECIFIC EVIDENCE FROM THE TEXT/MATERIALS	EVIDENCE RATING
Literature and Informational Text 2a. *Key Ideas and Details.* Questions and tasks require students to explicitly attend to the text, including, but not limited to: • Asking and answering questions to demonstrate understanding of a text, referring to the text as the basis for answers • Recounting stories, including fables, folktales, and myths from diverse cultures • Determining the central message, theme, or idea of a text, recounting key supporting details • Describing the characters in a story and explaining how their actions contribute to the sequence of events • Describing the relationship between a series of historical events, scientific concepts, or steps in technical procedures • Make inferences		○ 4) extensive ● 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ○ 1) weak

GUIDING STATEMENTS	SPECIFIC EVIDENCE FROM THE TEXT/MATERIALS	EVIDENCE RATING
2b. *Craft and Structure*. Questions and tasks require students to explicitly attend to the text, including, but not limited to: • Determining the meaning of words and phrases used in a text, including general academic and domain-specific words, and distinguishing literal from nonliteral language • Referring to parts of stories, dramas, or poems, using terms such as chapter, scene, and stanza, and how the parts build on earlier sections • Distinguishing their own point of view from that of the author, narrator, or characters in a text • Using text features and search tools such as keywords and side bars		○ 4) extensive ● 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ○ 1) weak
2c. *Integration of Knowledge and Ideas.* Questions and tasks require students to explicitly attend to the text, including, but not limited to: • Comparing and contrasting the most important points and details presented in two texts on the same topic • Comparing and contrasting the themes, settings, and plots of stories • Explaining how specific aspects of a text's illustrations contribute to what is described in words • Using information gained from illustrations		○ 4) extensive ● 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ○ 1) weak

OVERALL RATING: ○ 4) extensive evidence ● 3) sufficient evidence ○ 2) some evidence ○ 1) weak evidence

SUMMARY STATEMENT (Explain why the materials received this overall rating):
Questions vary in DOK levels.

ALIGNMENT CRITERION III. WRITING TO SOURCES AND RESEARCH

The writing standards for each grade level highlight distinctive expectations about student writing. For details on grade-level writing expectations and writing exemplars for grade three, see the Common Core State Standards for English Language Arts and Literacy. The metrics below show key characteristics to look for in your review of materials.

GUIDING STATEMENTS	SPECIFIC EVIDENCE FROM THE TEXT/MATERIALS	EVIDENCE RATING
3a. Writing assignments are explicitly connected to what students are reading, and routinely include writing over shorter time frames (a single sitting or a day or two) and extended time frames (for research, reflection, and revision) for a range of discipline-specific tasks, purposes, and audiences.		○ 4) extensive ○ 3) sufficient ● 2) some ○ 1) weak
3b. Text-dependent questions generally create the foundation for students to address culminating writing tasks, including: • Writing opinion pieces on topics or texts, supporting a point of view with reasons • Writing informative/explanatory texts to examine a topic and convey ideas and information clearly • Writing narratives to develop real or imagined experiences or events using effective technique, descriptive details, and clear sequences of events	Writing is limited to answering a text question.	○ 4) extensive ○ 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ● 1) weak
3c. Reading materials can serve as models to explore writer's craft, demonstrate use of domain-specific words and phrases, and support student production of grade-level narrative, informational, and opinion writing.		○ 4) extensive ○ 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ● 1) weak

GUIDING STATEMENTS	SPECIFIC EVIDENCE FROM THE TEXT/MATERIALS	EVIDENCE RATING
3d. Materials include explicit support to teachers, either in the teacher's edition or classroom materials, for writing instruction linked to the grade three writing standards, including: • Producing writing in which the development and organization are appropriate to the task and purpose • Developing and strengthening writing by planning, revising, and editing • Using technology to produce and publish writing, as well as to interact and collaborate with others Materials should also guide the teaching of specific components of grade three writing standards 1-3 (See CCSS).		○ 4) extensive ○ 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ● 1) weak
3e. Materials provide opportunities and resources for students to conduct short research projects that build knowledge about a topic, including: • Recalling information from experiences • Gathering information from print and digital sources • Taking brief notes on sources and sorting evidence into provided categories		○ 4) extensive ○ 3) sufficient ● 2) some ○ 1) weak

OVERALL RATING: ○ 4) extensive evidence ○ 3) sufficient evidence ○ 2) some evidence ● 1) weak evidence

SUMMARY STATEMENT (Explain why the materials received this overall rating):
This program is a reading program. Writing is limited to longer answers relating to the text. Some skill pages address note taking, but writer's workshop or writing instruction is not addressed.

ALIGNMENT CRITERION IV: FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS

Materials provide guidance and support for explicit and systematic instruction and diagnostic support in grade-level phonics, vocabulary development, syntax, and reading fluency. Students must be able to recognize and pronounce words fluently in order to focus on the major goal of reading, which is comprehension. Effective foundational skills instruction in grade three includes an explicit and systematic focus on phonics and practice in applying phonics for students who are struggling. Building word analysis skills and fluency must also be contextualized within the materials.

GUIDING STATEMENTS	SPECIFIC EVIDENCE FROM THE TEXT/MATERIALS	EVIDENCE RATING
4a. Materials provide teachers with guidance and support for explicit and systematic instruction of the grade three *Reading Standards for Foundational Skills*, including phonics, word analysis, and reading with fluency to support comprehension. (Refer to CCSS, Appendix A for the research detailing the advancement of foundational skills in reading.)	Each lesson has a phonics or word study component but it does not include a clear scope and sequence for instruction.	○ 4) extensive ○ 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ● 1) weak
4b. Materials include a variety of opportunities for students to develop and apply word analysis and decoding skills, including: • Understanding grade-level vocabulary • Identifying and knowing the meaning of most common prefixes and derivational suffixes • Decoding words with common Latin suffixes • Understanding multisyllabic words in context and out of context • Reading grade-appropriate irregularly-spelled words • Self-correcting using word recognition skills and context to confirm understanding		○ 4) extensive ○ 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ● 1) weak

GUIDING STATEMENTS	SPECIFIC EVIDENCE FROM THE TEXT/MATERIALS	EVIDENCE RATING
4c. Materials provide regular practice in reading grade-level prose and poetry with accuracy, at an appropriate rate, and with appropriate expression.		○ 4) extensive ○ 3) sufficient ● 2) some ○ 1) weak
4d. Materials guide students in reading grade-level texts with purpose and understanding, making frequent connections between the acquisition of foundational skills and access to the meaning of texts (including a set of text-dependent or text-specific questions to check for understanding).		○ 4) extensive ○ 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ● 1) weak

OVERALL RATING: ○ 4) extensive evidence ○ 3) sufficient evidence ○ 2) some evidence ● 1) weak evidence

SUMMARY STATEMENT (Explain why the materials received this overall rating):
This program is great for supplementing a reading program due to the fact that it has so many texts to choose from (including the on-line piece), but it is not a foundational skills program. It does not have a clear teaching sequence for educators.

ALIGNMENT CRITERION V: LANGUAGE

The Common Core State Standards for language focus on ensuring that students gain adequate mastery of a range of language skills and applications. Students are expected to meet each year's grade-specific standards and retain or further develop skills, knowledge, and vocabulary gained in preceding grades (CCSS).

GUIDING STATEMENTS	SPECIFIC EVIDENCE FROM THE TEXT/MATERIALS	EVIDENCE RATING
Conventions of Standard English 5a. There is evidence that grade-level grammar and conventions are addressed using an integrated and contextualized approach in daily instruction. Materials and tasks in grade three are designed to help build student understanding and use of: • Nouns (abstract, regular, and irregular) • Possessive pronouns • Regular and irregular verbs, and the simple verb tenses • Comparative and superlative adjectives and adverbs • Coordinating and subordinating conjunctions in writing compound and complex sentences • Commas (such as in addresses and with quotations in dialogue) • Correct spelling and capitalization, applying knowledge of spelling patterns and generalizations in writing words		○ 4) extensive ○ 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ● 1) weak
Knowledge of Language 5b. The materials support instruction on: • Choosing words and phrases for effect • Recognizing differences between the conventions of spoken and written English		○ 4) extensive ○ 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ● 1) weak

GUIDING STATEMENTS	SPECIFIC EVIDENCE FROM THE TEXT/MATERIALS	EVIDENCE RATING
Vocabulary Acquisition and Use 5c. The materials provide context, support, and strategies for developing vocabulary acquisition skills, including: • Using sentence-level context clues to unlock the meaning of words • Using affixes and roots as clues to the meaning of words • Consulting glossaries or beginning dictionaries to determine the meaning of words		○ 4) extensive ○ 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ● 1) weak
5d. The materials provide embedded opportunities for students to encounter and develop an understanding of word relationships and nuances in word meanings.		○ 4) extensive ○ 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ● 1) weak

OVERALL RATING: ○ 4) extensive evidence ○ 3) sufficient evidence ○ 2) some evidence ● 1) weak evidence

SUMMARY STATEMENT (Explain why the materials received this overall rating):
Texts included vocabulary support but it is limited.

ALIGNMENT CRITERION VI: SPEAKING AND LISTENING

To be CCSS-aligned, speaking and listening must be integrated into lessons, items, and tasks. These must reflect a progression of communication skills required for eventual college- and career-readiness, as outlined in the standards. If grade three students are able to listen to others, discuss what they are learning, and voice their own confusion or misunderstandings, their learning becomes deeper and more meaningful. They are exposed, at this level, to points of view that may differ from their own, and they learn how to agree and disagree, express their own thoughts, and ask questions when they don't understand or need more clarification (CCSS).

GUIDING STATEMENTS	SPECIFIC EVIDENCE FROM THE TEXT/MATERIALS	EVIDENCE RATING
6a. *Comprehension and Collaboration.* Materials provide a language framework that guides student participation in academic conversations, including the ability to: • Come to a discussion prepared • Follow agreed upon rules/roles • Pose and respond to specific questions to clarify or follow up on information • Review key ideas and explain their own ideas • Differentiate between contexts for formal English and situations where informal discourse is appropriate • Use accurate, grade-appropriate conversational, general academic, and domain-specific words and phrases		○ 4) extensive ○ 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ● 1) weak

GUIDING STATEMENTS	SPECIFIC EVIDENCE FROM THE TEXT/MATERIALS	EVIDENCE RATING
6b.*Presentation of Knowledge and Ideas.* Materials provide a language framework for student planning of effective presentations, focusing on: • How to report on a topic using evidence to present findings from their research • How to tell a story or recount an experience • How to use appropriate facts and relevant details to support ideas • How to speak in complete sentences when appropriate to the task and situation		○ 4) extensive ○ 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ● 1) weak

OVERALL RATING: ○ 4) extensive evidence ○ 3) sufficient evidence ○ 2) some evidence ● 1) weak evidence

SUMMARY STATEMENT (Explain why the materials received this overall rating):
Supports listening to books for comprehension, but student talk is determined by teacher.

ALIGNMENT CRITERION VII: SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORTS

While scaffolds are not a part of the standards themselves, it is important to support teachers in meeting the needs of the range of students in their classrooms. In order to meet the reading, speaking, and writing needs of ***all*** *grade three students, the materials must include supports for students to comprehend texts at the grades three through five-complexity band as required, and at the high end of this complexity band with scaffolding. Supports and scaffolds should draw students back to the text and provide strategies for vocabulary acquisition. All scaffolding and support requires ongoing formal and informal assessments that provide multiple opportunities for students to demonstrate their proficiency and inform instruction.*

Scaffolding is not just intended for struggling students, but also for students who are ready for above grade-level work. As text complexity increases and tasks get increasingly challenging, the need for appropriate scaffolds for above grade-level access is equally important (CCSS).

GUIDING STATEMENTS	SPECIFIC EVIDENCE FROM THE TEXT/MATERIALS	EVIDENCE RATING
7a. The texts promote differentiated instruction and instructional conversations about text to support student learning of: • Academic language • Linguistic frames • Repeated grammatical structures and language	Multiple levels of texts	○ 4) extensive ○ 3) sufficient ● 2) some ○ 1) weak
7b. The materials include student supports such as: • Multiple digital and media versions of texts • Illustrations • Graphs and charts • Maps and photographs • Visual cues/notes that draw attention to words in the text that signal sequence or offer clues to meaning (such as where, when, and how key events occur)	Program is on-line so great for work in class and at home	○ 4) extensive ○ 3) sufficient ● 2) some ○ 1) weak

GUIDING STATEMENTS	SPECIFIC EVIDENCE FROM THE TEXT/MATERIALS	EVIDENCE RATING
7c. The materials are designed to support teacher instruction by use of: • Explicit instructional directions accompanied by materials that are clearly aligned to stated goals and objectives that build student ability to read and comprehend grade-level text. • Strategies to gradually increase difficulty as students' comprehension skills strengthen • Strategies to support student acquisition of knowledge supporting specific common core standards • Clear and detailed teacher directions and guidance for introducing new concepts and skills • Clear guidance for documenting student progress toward meeting grade-level standards	Each lesson has teacher resources, but overall scope and sequence is up to teacher.	○ 4) extensive ○ 3) sufficient ● 2) some ○ 1) weak
7d. The materials provide support for student learning through varying modalities (i.e., there are provisions for print, digital, and other multimedia sources for information attainment).	Great on-line, need to print any materials yourself	○ 4) extensive ○ 3) sufficient ● 2) some ○ 1) weak

GUIDING STATEMENTS	SPECIFIC EVIDENCE FROM THE TEXT/MATERIALS	EVIDENCE RATING
7e. The materials include assessments along with: • Suggestions for next steps to address a spectrum of performance levels and needs based on assessment results • Opportunities for students to demonstrate their expertise through the use of performance tasks • Pieces of challenging and complete text that can be used to assess student understanding and next instructional steps • Reading selections and questions that progress in a logical sequence for gradual release[1] • Enrichment tasks for students who are on target for meeting grade-level expectations • Steps to take when evidence suggests that students are starting to fall behind		○ 4) extensive ○ 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ● 1) weak

OVERALL RATING: ○ 4) extensive evidence ○ 3) sufficient evidence ● 2) some evidence ○ 1) weak evidence

SUMMARY STATEMENT (Explain why the materials received this overall rating):
I like the leveled texts and student choice, but this is not a comprehensive program with clear instructional supports for all level of students.

1 Gradual release: scaffolding of instruction so that students develop the ability to read and complete tasks and assignments independently and proficiently.