ELA/Literacy Grade-Level Instructional Materials Evaluation Tool

Quality Review
GRADE 3

WCSD 2018

Washoe County School District
Every Child, By Name And Face, To Graduation℠

Council of the Great City Schools

COMPONENT 1: TEXT COMPLEXITY

The guiding statements provided in this section will examine text complexity in order to differentiate quality and richness among the texts WCSD is considering for adoption. To address the grade three standards, the submitted materials need to create the conditions for rich and robust discussion and writing for ALL students (struggling readers, students with identified academic disabilities, English Learners, students who are performing at grade level, and advanced students).

GUIDING STATEMENTS	SPECIFIC EVIDENCE FROM THE TEXT/MATERIALS	EVIDENCE RATING
Literature and Informational Text C1a. The texts present rich and embedded relationships between and among characters, ideas, and concepts that are conveyed through masterful style and structure. (See exemplars in CCSS, Appendix B.)	There are not student text books in this series. The trade books used are beautiful and can lead to quality questions, discussions, and writing opportunities.'m	○ 4) extensive ○ 3) sufficient ● 2) some ○ 1) weak
C1b. The materials consistently include short, challenging, and complete texts that contain rich content, ideas, and academic language worthy of close reading. (See exemplars in CCSS, Appendix B.)	The trade books contain complete texts with rich content. The student work books have some close reads with time for written and oral thoughts and discussions.	○ 4) extensive ● 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ○ 1) weak

C1c. The materials consistently provide opportunities to read both literary and informational texts in the grades three through five text complexity band with scaffolding as needed at the high end of the range.	There are good scaffolding directions for teachers. I find the lack of text books and leveled readers to be a problem.	○ 4) extensive ○ 3) sufficient ● 2) some ○ 1) weak
C1d. Materials provide instructional content and strategies for grade-level vocabulary acquisition.	The teacher's manuals and the student workbooks have vocabulary acquisition opportunities.	○ 4) extensive ● 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ○ 1) weak

OVERALL RATING: ○ 4) extensive evidence ○ 3) sufficient evidence ○ 2) some evidence ○ 1) weak evidence

SUMMARY STATEMENT (Explain why the materials received this overall rating):
I find the materials lacking in printed texts for students to use.

COMPONENT 2: QUESTIONS AND TASKS

At least 80% of all questions in the submission are high-quality text-dependent and text-specific questions. The overwhelming majority of these questions reference specific text and draw student attention to the text they are reading. Text-dependent questions that address the grade three standards will be described in greater depth in Alignment Criterion II.

ALIGNMENT CRITERION I: RANGE AND QUALITY OF TEXTS

Materials must reflect a wide range of text types and genres, as required by the standards. In grade three, and across all other grade levels, there should be ample texts on topics that can support sustained study. Knowledge built at one grade level should be expanded in other grade levels. Topics should take into account individual student academic needs and interests in order to foster independent reading. It is also imperative that the included topics and themes are compelling enough to read multiple times and are aligned to district needs. Pay particular attention to the guidance provided in Appendix B of the Common Core State Standards.

GUIDING STATEMENTS	SPECIFIC EVIDENCE FROM THE TEXT/MATERIALS	EVIDENCE RATING
Literature and Informational Text 1a. The range of materials, both print and digital, allows teachers and students to explore content that coherently and systematically builds knowledge and vocabulary across subjects, themes, and topics. (See CCSS Appendix B for examples of grade-level knowledge demands.) Text sets also address a wide variety of student interests, and are likely to foster independent reading.	There are digital resources which parallel the printed material. Since I feel there are not enough printed materials for the students and many classrooms in our district do not have computers for many students, I feel the access to text exploration.	○ 4) extensive ○ 3) sufficient ● 2) some ○ 1) weak
1b. Text sets include a diverse range of high quality, culturally-responsive and appropriate topics and themes. Texts from diverse cultures reflect the same high-quality features that are demanded of all texts.	The trade books do have a diverse range of quality, culturally-responsive topics and themes.	○ 4) extensive ● 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ○ 1) weak

GUIDING STATEMENTS	SPECIFIC EVIDENCE FROM THE TEXT/MATERIALS	EVIDENCE RATING
1c. Materials include a rich and diverse sampling of literary texts including, but not limited to: • Fables, folktales, and myths from diverse cultures • Stories, drama, and poetry • Multiple stories by the same author		◉ 4) extensive ○ 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ○ 1) weak
1d. The range of informational texts include selections that: • Present historical events • Describe technical procedures • Present scientific ideas or concepts • Contain relevant visual representations of information • Contain at least two texts on the same topic	The science and social study standards are embedded for cross-curricular engagement. I found all of the concepts to accurate to my knowledge.	○ 4) extensive ◉ 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ○ 1) weak
1e. Student reading materials contain a range of increasingly challenging selections that allow teachers to build students' ability to comprehend complex text and expand vocabulary throughout the school year.	True. The trade books spiral up in complexity as the year progresses. The lesson components also are a gradual release of concepts and foundational skills.	◉ 4) extensive ○ 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ○ 1) weak

OVERALL RATING: ○ 4) extensive evidence ◉ 3) sufficient evidence ○ 2) some evidence ○ 1) weak evidence

SUMMARY STATEMENT (Explain why the materials received this overall rating):
I find the materials adequate but not a big improvement on the Core Knowledge readers being taught in 3rd grade in our district. I think the teache manuals are sufficient but the available texts are not.

ALIGNMENT CRITERION II. QUESTIONS AND TASKS SUPPORT STUDENT LEARNING

Questions posed to students in the materials under review should support student learning in building reading comprehension, in finding and producing the textual evidence to support responses, and in developing grade-level academic language and domain-specific words and phrases. Text for grade three students must include text-dependent questions that require the use of higher order thinking skills. There should be a range of questions that require students to attend to the author's language as his/her vehicle for conveying meaning, as well as to support specific inferences with explicit details from the text. Most questions should require that the student refer to the text in several places in order to devise an answer—rather than asking only literal, "right there" types of questions—and should also require the student to begin comparing texts, authors, and opinions (CCSS).

GUIDING STATEMENTS	SPECIFIC EVIDENCE FROM THE TEXT/MATERIALS	EVIDENCE RATING
Literature and Informational Text 2a. *Key Ideas and Details.* Questions and tasks require students to explicitly attend to the text, including, but not limited to: • Asking and answering questions to demonstrate understanding of a text, referring to the text as the basis for answers • Recounting stories, including fables, folktales, and myths from diverse cultures • Determining the central message, theme, or idea of a text, recounting key supporting details • Describing the characters in a story and explaining how their actions contribute to the sequence of events • Describing the relationship between a series of historical events, scientific concepts, or steps in technical procedures • Make inferences	Some topics and daily lessons have high level questioning points. Some have more literal. There is recounting of stories, fables, folktales, and myths from diverse cultures. I did find some character trait discussions.	○ 4) extensive ● 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ○ 1) weak

GUIDING STATEMENTS	SPECIFIC EVIDENCE FROM THE TEXT/MATERIALS	EVIDENCE RATING
2b. *Craft and Structure*. Questions and tasks require students to explicitly attend to the text, including, but not limited to: • Determining the meaning of words and phrases used in a text, including general academic and domain-specific words, and distinguishing literal from nonliteral language • Referring to parts of stories, dramas, or poems, using terms such as chapter, scene, and stanza, and how the parts build on earlier sections • Distinguishing their own point of view from that of the author, narrator, or characters in a text • Using text features and search tools such as keywords and side bars	Students are asked to speak in academic terms when referring to parts of the stories. Point of view is brought up but I didn't find a lot of study on this.	○ 4) extensive ● 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ○ 1) weak
2c. *Integration of Knowledge and Ideas.* Questions and tasks require students to explicitly attend to the text, including, but not limited to: • Comparing and contrasting the most important points and details presented in two texts on the same topic • Comparing and contrasting the themes, settings, and plots of stories • Explaining how specific aspects of a text's illustrations contribute to what is described in words • Using information gained from illustrations	There is some discussion on comparing themes. Illustrations are referred to but not always indepth.	○ 4) extensive ○ 3) sufficient ● 2) some ○ 1) weak

OVERALL RATING: ○ 4) extensive evidence ○ 3) sufficient evidence ● 2) some evidence ○ 1) weak evidence

SUMMARY STATEMENT (Explain why the materials received this overall rating):
I find it is difficult to locate the integration of knowledge and ideas because the teacher's manual is difficult to read both in font and organization. After

ALIGNMENT CRITERION III. WRITING TO SOURCES AND RESEARCH

The writing standards for each grade level highlight distinctive expectations about student writing. For details on grade-level writing expectations and writing exemplars for grade three, see the Common Core State Standards for English Language Arts and Literacy. The metrics below show key characteristics to look for in your review of materials.

GUIDING STATEMENTS	SPECIFIC EVIDENCE FROM THE TEXT/MATERIALS	EVIDENCE RATING
3a. Writing assignments are explicitly connected to what students are reading, and routinely include writing over shorter time frames (a single sitting or a day or two) and extended time frames (for research, reflection, and revision) for a range of discipline-specific tasks, purposes, and audiences.		○ 4) extensive ● 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ○ 1) weak
3b. Text-dependent questions generally create the foundation for students to address culminating writing tasks, including: • Writing opinion pieces on topics or texts, supporting a point of view with reasons • Writing informative/explanatory texts to examine a topic and convey ideas and information clearly • Writing narratives to develop real or imagined experiences or events using effective technique, descriptive details, and clear sequences of events	All writing standards are addressed in the writing component. There is a progression of writing skills.	○ 4) extensive ● 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ○ 1) weak
3c. Reading materials can serve as models to explore writer's craft, demonstrate use of domain-specific words and phrases, and support student production of grade-level narrative, informational, and opinion writing.		○ 4) extensive ● 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ○ 1) weak

GUIDING STATEMENTS	SPECIFIC EVIDENCE FROM THE TEXT/MATERIALS	EVIDENCE RATING
3d. Materials include explicit support to teachers, either in the teacher's edition or classroom materials, for writing instruction linked to the grade three writing standards, including: • Producing writing in which the development and organization are appropriate to the task and purpose • Developing and strengthening writing by planning, revising, and editing • Using technology to produce and publish writing, as well as to interact and collaborate with others Materials should also guide the teaching of specific components of grade three writing standards 1-3 (See CCSS).	Although the writing standards are all addressed, I find the teacher manual to be quite difficult to read and difficult to look for specific writing skills although they are covered. The student workbooks have practice for writing skills, also.	○ 4) extensive ● 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ○ 1) weak
3e. Materials provide opportunities and resources for students to conduct short research projects that build knowledge about a topic, including: • Recalling information from experiences • Gathering information from print and digital sources • Taking brief notes on sources and sorting evidence into provided categories		○ 4) extensive ● 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ○ 1) weak

OVERALL RATING: ○ 4) extensive evidence ● 3) sufficient evidence ○ 2) some evidence ○ 1) weak evidence

SUMMARY STATEMENT (Explain why the materials received this overall rating):
Although the writing standards are well-covered, I think this is a just-average program for teaching writing--perhaps a separate manual for writing and language would work better for me.

ALIGNMENT CRITERION IV: FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS

Materials provide guidance and support for explicit and systematic instruction and diagnostic support in grade-level phonics, vocabulary development, syntax, and reading fluency. Students must be able to recognize and pronounce words fluently in order to focus on the major goal of reading, which is comprehension. Effective foundational skills instruction in grade three includes an explicit and systematic focus on phonics and practice in applying phonics for students who are struggling. Building word analysis skills and fluency must also be contextualized within the materials.

GUIDING STATEMENTS	SPECIFIC EVIDENCE FROM THE TEXT/MATERIALS	EVIDENCE RATING
4a. Materials provide teachers with guidance and support for explicit and systematic instruction of the grade three *Reading Standards for Foundational Skills*, including phonics, word analysis, and reading with fluency to support comprehension. (Refer to CCSS, Appendix A for the research detailing the advancement of foundational skills in reading.)	There are sufficient lessons which meet the standards for foundational skills. The workbooks provide some support. I find this is lacking in fluency support.	○ 4) extensive ○ 3) sufficient ● 2) some ○ 1) weak
4b. Materials include a variety of opportunities for students to develop and apply word analysis and decoding skills, including: • Understanding grade-level vocabulary • Identifying and knowing the meaning of most common prefixes and derivational suffixes • Decoding words with common Latin suffixes • Understanding multisyllabic words in context and out of context • Reading grade-appropriate irregularly-spelled words • Self-correcting using word recognition skills and context to confirm understanding	I see evidence for the development of all the skills needed to read. There is limited support for decoding, phonics, and word analysis. I don't think there is enough student practice without a lot of teacher made materials.	○ 4) extensive ○ 3) sufficient ● 2) some ○ 1) weak

GUIDING STATEMENTS	SPECIFIC EVIDENCE FROM THE TEXT/MATERIALS	EVIDENCE RATING
4c. Materials provide regular practice in reading grade-level prose and poetry with accuracy, at an appropriate rate, and with appropriate expression.	I didn't find much poetry for students.	○ 4) extensive ○ 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ● 1) weak
4d. Materials guide students in reading grade-level texts with purpose and understanding, making frequent connections between the acquisition of foundational skills and access to the meaning of texts (including a set of text-dependent or text-specific questions to check for understanding).	Not enough grade level texts nor leveled readers.	○ 4) extensive ○ 3) sufficient ● 2) some ○ 1) weak

OVERALL RATING: ○ 4) extensive evidence ○ 3) sufficient evidence ● 2) some evidence ○ 1) weak evidence

SUMMARY STATEMENT (Explain why the materials received this overall rating):
I see enough direction and practice for foundational skills.

ALIGNMENT CRITERION V: LANGUAGE

The Common Core State Standards for language focus on ensuring that students gain adequate mastery of a range of language skills and applications. Students are expected to meet each year's grade-specific standards and retain or further develop skills, knowledge, and vocabulary gained in preceding grades (CCSS).

GUIDING STATEMENTS	SPECIFIC EVIDENCE FROM THE TEXT/MATERIALS	EVIDENCE RATING
Conventions of Standard English 5a. There is evidence that grade-level grammar and conventions are addressed using an integrated and contextualized approach in daily instruction. Materials and tasks in grade three are designed to help build student understanding and use of: • Nouns (abstract, regular, and irregular) • Possessive pronouns • Regular and irregular verbs, and the simple verb tenses • Comparative and superlative adjectives and adverbs • Coordinating and subordinating conjunctions in writing compound and complex sentences • Commas (such as in addresses and with quotations in dialogue) • Correct spelling and capitalization, applying knowledge of spelling patterns and generalizations in writing words	Instruction and practice are included in this series. I don't see enough practice for students without teacher made materials.	○ 4) extensive ● 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ○ 1) weak
Knowledge of Language 5b. The materials support instruction on: • Choosing words and phrases for effect • Recognizing differences between the conventions of spoken and written English		○ 4) extensive ● 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ○ 1) weak

GUIDING STATEMENTS	SPECIFIC EVIDENCE FROM THE TEXT/MATERIALS	EVIDENCE RATING
Vocabulary Acquisition and Use 5c. The materials provide context, support, and strategies for developing vocabulary acquisition skills, including: • Using sentence-level context clues to unlock the meaning of words • Using affixes and roots as clues to the meaning of words • Consulting glossaries or beginning dictionaries to determine the meaning of words	Many lessons include vocabulary acquistion and practice. There is directed instruction for word strategies and clues.	○ 4) extensive ● 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ○ 1) weak
5d. The materials provide embedded opportunities for students to encounter and develop an understanding of word relationships and nuances in word meanings.		○ 4) extensive ● 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ○ 1) weak

OVERALL RATING: ○ 4) extensive evidence ○ 3) sufficient evidence ● 2) some evidence ○ 1) weak evidence

SUMMARY STATEMENT (Explain why the materials received this overall rating):
There are lessons with word acquistion strategies. I do not find it user friendly and relies too much on teacher prepared/made materials.

ALIGNMENT CRITERION VI: SPEAKING AND LISTENING

To be CCSS-aligned, speaking and listening must be integrated into lessons, items, and tasks. These must reflect a progression of communication skills required for eventual college- and career-readiness, as outlined in the standards. If grade three students are able to listen to others, discuss what they are learning, and voice their own confusion or misunderstandings, their learning becomes deeper and more meaningful. They are exposed, at this level, to points of view that may differ from their own, and they learn how to agree and disagree, express their own thoughts, and ask questions when they don't understand or need more clarification (CCSS).

GUIDING STATEMENTS	SPECIFIC EVIDENCE FROM THE TEXT/MATERIALS	EVIDENCE RATING
6a. *Comprehension and Collaboration.* Materials provide a language framework that guides student participation in academic conversations, including the ability to: • Come to a discussion prepared • Follow agreed upon rules/roles • Pose and respond to specific questions to clarify or follow up on information • Review key ideas and explain their own ideas • Differentiate between contexts for formal English and situations where informal discourse is appropriate • Use accurate, grade-appropriate conversational, general academic, and domain-specific words and phrases	There are teacher guided discussions in the daily lessons. The students are taught how to attend and participate in whole group and small group activities related to the materials.	○ 4) extensive ● 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ○ 1) weak

GUIDING STATEMENTS	SPECIFIC EVIDENCE FROM THE TEXT/MATERIALS	EVIDENCE RATING
6b.*Presentation of Knowledge and Ideas.* Materials provide a language framework for student planning of effective presentations, focusing on: • How to report on a topic using evidence to present findings from their research • How to tell a story or recount an experience • How to use appropriate facts and relevant details to support ideas • How to speak in complete sentences when appropriate to the task and situation	There are some research opportunities. Students are asked to retell stories and recount from personal experiences.	○ 4) extensive ● 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ○ 1) weak

OVERALL RATING: ○ 4) extensive evidence ● 3) sufficient evidence ○ 2) some evidence ○ 1) weak evidence

SUMMARY STATEMENT (Explain why the materials received this overall rating):
Many lessons include discussions about the readings. Students are taught to use appropriated academic language in complete sentences for discussion.

ALIGNMENT CRITERION VII: SCAFFOLDING AND SUPPORTS

While scaffolds are not a part of the standards themselves, it is important to support teachers in meeting the needs of the range of students in their classrooms. In order to meet the reading, speaking, and writing needs of ***all*** *grade three students, the materials must include supports for students to comprehend texts at the grades three through five-complexity band as required, and at the high end of this complexity band with scaffolding. Supports and scaffolds should draw students back to the text and provide strategies for vocabulary acquisition. All scaffolding and support requires ongoing formal and informal assessments that provide multiple opportunities for students to demonstrate their proficiency and inform instruction.*

Scaffolding is not just intended for struggling students, but also for students who are ready for above grade-level work. As text complexity increases and tasks get increasingly challenging, the need for appropriate scaffolds for above grade-level access is equally important (CCSS).

GUIDING STATEMENTS	SPECIFIC EVIDENCE FROM THE TEXT/MATERIALS	EVIDENCE RATING
7a. The texts promote differentiated instruction and instructional conversations about text to support student learning of: • Academic language • Linguistic frames • Repeated grammatical structures and language	Scaffolding and small group instruction is included. I found the small group work to be less effective than the ELL suggestions which are extensive.	○ 4) extensive ● 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ○ 1) weak
7b. The materials include student supports such as: • Multiple digital and media versions of texts • Illustrations • Graphs and charts • Maps and photographs • Visual cues/notes that draw attention to words in the text that signal sequence or offer clues to meaning (such as where, when, and how key events occur)	Digital support is provided which parallels the teacher edition. Because there are only trade books for reading, I feel this series only has some supports.	○ 4) extensive ○ 3) sufficient ● 2) some ○ 1) weak

GUIDING STATEMENTS	SPECIFIC EVIDENCE FROM THE TEXT/MATERIALS	EVIDENCE RATING
7c. The materials are designed to support teacher instruction by use of: • Explicit instructional directions accompanied by materials that are clearly aligned to stated goals and objectives that build student ability to read and comprehend grade-level text. • Strategies to gradually increase difficulty as students' comprehension skills strengthen • Strategies to support student acquisition of knowledge supporting specific common core standards • Clear and detailed teacher directions and guidance for introducing new concepts and skills • Clear guidance for documenting student progress toward meeting grade-level standards	Yes, the materials are extensive in teacher support, however, the lack of ease of the organization of the guides and the dryness of the guides make them less than attractive to teachers. There is a gradual release of information which increases in difficulty.	○ 4) extensive ○ 3) sufficient ● 2) some ○ 1) weak
7d. The materials provide support for student learning through varying modalities (i.e., there are provisions for print, digital, and other multimedia sources for information attainment).	I have to rate this as some since student texts and leveled reading books are not part of this series.	○ 4) extensive ○ 3) sufficient ● 2) some ○ 1) weak

GUIDING STATEMENTS	SPECIFIC EVIDENCE FROM THE TEXT/MATERIALS	EVIDENCE RATING
7e. The materials include assessments along with: • Suggestions for next steps to address a spectrum of performance levels and needs based on assessment results • Opportunities for students to demonstrate their expertise through the use of performance tasks • Pieces of challenging and complete text that can be used to assess student understanding and next instructional steps • Reading selections and questions that progress in a logical sequence for gradual release[1] • Enrichment tasks for students who are on target for meeting grade-level expectations • Steps to take when evidence suggests that students are starting to fall behind	There are multiple assessments provided although I did not find a beginning of the year assessment which I feel is important. Assessments can be online. There is information for teachers to help with diagnosing student reading issues but I don't feel it is teacher friendly.	○ 4) extensive ● 3) sufficient ○ 2) some ○ 1) weak

OVERALL RATING: ○ 4) extensive evidence ○ 3) sufficient evidence ● 2) some evidence ○ 1) weak evidence

SUMMARY STATEMENT (Explain why the materials received this overall rating):
I find this series to be one I would not like to adopt. The teacher's manuals feel like I'm reading the telephone book in print and attractiveness for the user. The standards are met but this is not a complete series to me without the texts and leveled readers.

1 Gradual release: scaffolding of instruction so that students develop the ability to read and complete tasks and assignments independently and proficiently.